Meta-Analysis on Green Human Resource Management Practices and Retaining Employees in Hotel Industry

Adeyefa Adedayo Emmanuel1,2, Zuraina Dato’ Mansor1, Abdul Rashid Abdullah1, 1Department of Management and Marketing, School of Business and Economics, Universiti Putra Malaysia.43400UPM. Serdang, Selangor, Malaysia. 2Department of Hospitality and Tourism, Federal University of Agriculture, Abeokuta Nigeria.

Employee turnover is considered one of the endemic issues for the hospitality industry around the globe. At the same time, this industry is strongly capitalizing on its human resources to gain its competitive advantage. A lot of studies on human resource practices mostly focused on the universal interest in the minds of practitioners and researchers, but not many have been conducted in the hotel especially in a less developed country such as Nigeria, what more with the effect of green human resource management (GHRM) in influencing retention of employees. GHRM initiatives have found to be helping organizations find alternate ways to reduce costs without losing their skilled and highly placed talent and encourage sustainable business practices. GHRM also teaches the workforce and society to be aware and utilize natural resources more economically and enhance eco-friendly products. This paper review and discuss past studies on GHRM and retention in Hotel industry as a meta-analysis paper for guiding the future studies in this theme. At the same time, it is hoped that this paper can raise the interest and awareness of GHRM activities and the reasons why it should be adopted as a solution for retaining employees, specifically in Nigeria.

Key words: Green Human Resource Management, Employee retention, Hotel Industry
1.0 Introduction

The hospitality industry is the world's largest and fastest-growing industry where hotels are defined as 'globalization vehicles' because they accommodate tourists and commercial explorers around the world (Linge, 2012). A hotel is an institution that offers short-term, paying accommodation (Barkey, 2006), and in many countries, the sector plays an essential part in the economy of the nation (Duncan, 2005). The industry is a competitive business sector where effective human capital management is required to confirm quality and productivity in the delivery of services (Hanzaee & Mirvaisi, 2011), and this include hotels in Nigeria, which represent the industry's most economically active facilities (National Bureau of Statistics, 2015).

However, it is reported that the hotel industry's turnover rate is estimated to be between 30% and 300%, much higher than the manufacturing industry's annual turnover rate of around 35% (Walker & Miller, 2010), and has been considered as one of the endemic issues in the hospitality industry (Nivethitha, Dyaram & Kamalanabhan, 2014). This finding is supported by Shaheen & Gupta's (2017) who indicated that hotel industry turnover levels are higher than in other sectors, for instance, in 2015, the average rate of hotel turnover was 72% compared to manufacturing 14.8% and Banking Industry 19.1%. Why turnover is high? It is because, the sector relies heavily on employee services (Twum, 2015). It is acknowledged that the employee is an organization's most vital resource, considered as the organization's top assets, and as such, companies must maintain existing talent to prevent new recruitment (Daifallah & Awwad, 2017). If employees cannot fully exploit their ability and are not noticed and respected, they will quit because of the disappointment and pressure (Kakar, Raziq & Khan, 2015). Even if the employees stay with the company, dissatisfaction and discontent feelings would have adverse effects that could have an impact on performance and productivity (Daifallah & Awwad, 2017). So, the challenge here is how to make employee stays or how to retain them. Employee retention is a major concern for each sector, and it remains as a key issue in the hospitality industry, particularly at a time when servicing sector growth and high labor costs are increasing (Twum, 2015), and as stated by Choi & Dickson (2009) hotels’ employees and guests determine the success of the business. According to some scholars, the problem may arise due to administrators failed to address the employee retention problem or they have failed to deal with the issues (Alexakis, 2011; Kuckusta, Guillet & Lau, 2014).

A considerable number of studies on how to promote employees’ retention have been performed in Asia, as well as in Western and other emerging nations (Boxall, et al., 2003; Ghazali, et al., 2008; Rana, et al., 2009; Singh, et al., 2010; Akter, 2012 & Bal, et al., 2014), however, it is remained a global problem, including Nigeria, especially in the hospitality sector, it is a major issue for the economy, researchers and practitioners (Ohunakin et al., 2016 & Akwara et al., 2014). In their studies, Ohunakin et al, (2016) have pointed that there was little awareness of the adoption of green human resource management (GHRM) practices in the
hospitality sector in Nigeria, and they suggested that it is crucial in assessing the GHRM in assessing employee turnover (Ohunakin et al., 2018). Literature has shown that there are very limited studies on GHRM in the evolving countries like Nigeria, despite the high knowledge and level of understanding of sustainable practices across the world and market implementation literature (Muazu et al., 2017). Therefore, this study aimed to provide a better understanding of adopting GHRM mechanisms as a panacea to enhance retention in Nigeria hotels.

1.1 GHRM and turnover or retention issues in Hotel Sectors

One of the major issues and challenges faced by the hospitality organizations today is to manage the changing employment relationship, this is especially critical due to the industry heavily a customer service-oriented business and it is capitalizing extremely on its human resources to accomplish its competitive advantage (Nevehitha, Dyaram & Kamalabhan, 2014). Some of the reasons for the high turnover in the hotel industry, particularly the front desk workers who work 24/7 because of the inflexible nature of their job and when they enter the industry, the low skill level is required (Yam & Raybould, 2011). Other certain reasons for increasing turnover in the hotel sector are pay, lack of development opportunities, and bad working conditions with greater efforts by staff and fewer receivables (Allen, 2008).

Pertaining the studies on HRM and retention, Irshad, Afridi(2012) & Muhammad et al.,(2011) asserts that retaining of employees is the greatest goal for an organization because the recruitment of a suitable applicant is crucial for a workplace, but retention is more vital than recruitment as a substantial amount is spent on orientation and new workforce training. In other studies, it is stated that as the creation and delivery of hotel services is based on the employees (Faldetta, Fasone & Provenzano,2013), the sector's success depends mainly on their practices in recruiting, managing and retaining employees, and employees are very significant because they contribute their expertise and knowledge to their organizations, (Boxall & Purcell, 2003 & Twum, 2015). Therefore, Daifallah & Awwad (2017) suggested that it is very important that the hoteliers must be able to point out the factors why employees leaving the organization so that management can adopt the appropriate treatment (Ongori,2007), including to combine the employee retention from a management perspective and the sustainability perspective. Robinson et al., (2014) suggested that employees would remain with a company if a combination of retention tactics makes leaving appear less than advantageous. GHRM is an environmentally friendly program aimed at improving work efficiency, lower costs, and higher levels of employee engagement (Rani & Mishra, 2014). Nevertheless, the impact of GHRM systems is still less reported, yet it is said that there is a need to focus on results that encourage organizations that used and implemented the GHRM activities (Jabbar & Abid, 2015).

The Green Human Resource Management (GHRM) which emerged in the human resources sector (Jackson et al.,2011 & Renwick et al.,2013) is a new research trend(Jackson & Seo,2010&Ones, Dilchert,2012, Jackson et al.,2014; Jabbour,2013). GHRM considers the climate protection area of the HRM (Renwick et al., 2013) and should promote positive
environmental outcomes (Kramar, 2014). It is responsible for creating green workers that appreciate, understand, regard and practice green creativity and preserves its green ideas via the process of HRM in recruiting, selecting, compensating, training & development, and evolve the companies’ human capital (Mathapati, 2013: Jabbour & Jabbour, 2016).

Based on a comprehensive literature review, it can be said most studies on the green practices in hotels are concentrated on how to use green practice, such as focusing on using energy-saving appliances, water-efficient equipment, water, and energy conservation and waste management (Muazu et al., 2017: Wu, Teng & Hung, 2013). And, it is suggested that with a successful implementation of human resource management practices, it will promote the continued growth of the company and optimize the business in taking advantage of economic opportunities to achieve corporate goals (Yi, Natarajan & Gong, 2011) therefore, limited research were done on employee retention in the hotel industry while several studies have done in other fields to evaluate the effects of GHRM and most results are favorable as GHRM are found suitable to be used in different aspects as described in the Meta-Analysis shown in the table below:

**Table**: Provide the summary of past studies on GHRM

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Author/Regional context/ Year</th>
<th>Research Topic/ Regional Context</th>
<th>Theory</th>
<th>Findings</th>
<th>Further studies / Recommendation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sunday Adewale Olaleye &amp; Ismail Temitayo Sanusi (2019).</td>
<td>The Need for Green Companies in Nigeria: A Study of Electronic Invoicing. (Nigeria)</td>
<td>Organizational Theory</td>
<td>Findings show the importance of four drivers of e-invoicing: facilitation of the condition, image, social facilitation. In this review, it was not found that the anticipated effort and results were important.</td>
<td>The study suggests further investigation using behavioral intention to balance gender, age, experience, and voluntary use.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chukwuka, J. Jebolise &amp; Emmanuel Emmanuel (2018).</td>
<td>Effect of Green Business practices on Organizational Performance of selected manufacturing firms in Nigeria. (Nigeria)</td>
<td>Ecological Modernization Theory</td>
<td>Findings showed that green business policies had a significant and positive effect on the profitability of the chosen manufacturing firm.</td>
<td>The study proposed further research on Green Business Initiatives; first, Green Business Practice and Green Sustainability. Proof of retail banking. An assessment, Green business practices, risk, price, and rewards. Empirical</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Authors</td>
<td>Title</td>
<td>Theory</td>
<td>Summary</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kim Yong Joong, Woo Gon Kim, Hyung-Min Choia &amp; Kullada Phetvaroon</td>
<td>The effect of green human resource management on hotel employees’ eco-friendly behavior and environmental performance. (Thailand)</td>
<td>Social identity theory</td>
<td>The results show that GHRM increases the organizational engagement of employees, their environmentally-friendly actions, and the environmental efficiency of hotels. Potential research should be done on data gathering from managers or peers to assess the ecological actions of the employees. Second, the new study should gather data from an eastern country.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mehran Nejati A, Soodabeth Rabiei B &amp; Charbel Jos E, Chiappetta Jabbour</td>
<td>Envisioning the invisible: Understanding the synergy between green human resource management and green supply chain management in manufacturing firms in Iran in light of the moderating effect of employees’ resistance to change. (Iran)</td>
<td>Resource-Based Theory</td>
<td>The study revealed that statistical support was provided among the direct relationships between green HRM dimensions and green supply chain management hypotheses, showing the positive impact of green human resource management to stimulate. A study suggests that in future research, the issues of &quot;Green Creation and Learning,&quot; &quot;Green Employee Empowerment,&quot; and &quot;Green Pay and Compensation&quot; could be discussed by considering the supply chain context.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Guiyao Tang, Yang Chen, Yuan Jiang, Pasca Paille &amp; Jinjia</td>
<td>Green human resource management practices: scale development and validity. (China)</td>
<td>Resource-based theory</td>
<td>GHRM was developed to cover five proportions: green recruitment and selection, green preparedness, green performance management, green compensation and bonuses, and It suggests research could go on researching the relationship between Environmental Management (EM) and GHRM. A recognition of cross-cultural HRM practices in EM is also required. Linking the</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Author(s)</td>
<td>Title</td>
<td>Contexts, East, and West.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td>--------------------------</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jenny Dumont, Jie Shen &amp; Xin Deng (China, 2016).</td>
<td>Practice effects of green HRM practices on employee workplace Green behavior: the role of Psychological green Climate and Employee Green values.</td>
<td>Findings showed that green HRM influenced the in-role of green behavior, directly and indirectly, but only indirectly influenced green extra-role behavior by mediating a green psychological climate. The impact of the green psychological environment on green extra-role behavior was moderated by personal green values, but the effect of green HRM was not mitigated. This research does not follow an approach at multilevel. Future studies have been suggested to consider using the multilevel method to take account of the particular organizational implications of HRM research.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Charbel Jos E, Chiappetta Jabbour &amp; Ana Beatriz Lopez de (2016).</td>
<td>Green Human Resource Management and Green Supply Chain Management: linking two emerging Agendas. (Brazil)</td>
<td>Results show that the key HRM barriers affecting GSCM would improve the partnership between GHRM-GSCM synergy and more efficient supply chains. Regarding future studies, the main recommendation is to use qualitative (multiple case studies and interviews) and/or quantitative (empirical) studies to examine the application and validity of the proposed method.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
2.0 Important of Environmental Sustainability in Hotel Management including managing the Employee Retention

Management is under pressure to pursue ethical practices across all aspects of their activities (Mathiyazhagan et al., 2013) and participate in sustainable management (Dubey et al., 2017). Studies have shown that it is becoming clear every organization must put initiatives to show their support in human resources practices including the planning, performance assessment with greening incentives (Daily & Huang, 2001). This is because, sustainability and productivity issues have a strong relationship and vital with green labor motivation in this current ever-changing and demanding industrial revolution era (Jackson et al., 2014).

Employees should take part in environmental management, which will encourage them to promote pollution reduction and recognize environmental opportunities (Renwick et al., 2013). The workers must be engaged in the process of deciding on the best ideas that could come up with any level of employee. It is pertinent to note that hoteliers need to focus on the hotel industry due to the nature of the job. From the scholars such as Bohadanowicz, Kasim (2006) & Mbasera (2017), Zientara & Novotna (2011), hotels are prominent among other commercial buildings for the consumption of high-water and indoor recycling of large proportions of waste and air quality issues, for instance, European hotels are discharging about 13.6 megatons of carbon dioxide constantly (Yusof, & Jamaludin, 2013).
In relations to service industries such as hotels, their efforts on green contain reduction of waste, conservation of energy, water in their operations, enlighten employees and customers (Bohdanowicz et al., 2011 & Rahman et al., 2012). For instance, to protect the environment, Hilton created operational goals, strategies, and eco-friendly programs and established reporting tools to monitor its development. As an outcome, Hilton Globally decreased its consumption of water completely by 14.1% and energy usage by 14.5% from 2009 to 2014 (Kim et al., 2018). If the hoteliers are aware and are conscious of environmental sustainability and adopt GHRM practices, this will create a competitive advantage and also enhance productivity including retaining employees in the hotel industry.

2.1 Definition of the components for GHRM

i. Green recruitment & selection

Green recruitment is a procedure in which the value of the climate is taken into account and making it a key element within the organization, thus it is expected that when a company performed its recruitment & selection that is the process of hiring of qualified green applicants without the use of papers, i.e. applications for jobs may be accepted electronically. Interviews can be performed online or over the phone (Harvey et al., 2010 & Jabbar, Abid, 2015). Recruiting and selecting candidates with the green-conscious mind will make it easy for professionals’ induction for firms who are conscious with sustainable procedures and are already aware with the basic things such as conservation, recycling, and create a more rational world (Grolleau et al., 2012 & Shoeb, 2015). Green recruitment & selection variables are relatively new to be explored in the Nigerian hotel industry because researchers are yet to make it explicit for hoteliers.

ii. Green training & development

Green training provides skills and knowledge to help employees follow sustainable policies and practices in a positive way that motivates them. This strengthens green incentives to engage in an organization with environmental know-how and skills, for example through interacting expertise and information (Govindarajulu, Daily, 2004 & Nhat et al., 2018). Green training and development inform staff about the importance of the company, train them on waste reduction procedures, energy conservation and provide the ability to engage employees in solving organizational problems (Shoeb, 2015 & Zoogah, 2011).

iii Green Performance appraisal

Green performance appraisal enables the employer to retain competent and skillful employees who are taking care of environmental issues within the organization by rewarding their efforts. Thus, HR managers need to develop and implement environmentally friendly performance indicators and evaluation processes (Marcus & Fremeth, 2009 & Samuel et al., 2019).
Currently, some firms attend to the issue of quality monitoring by implementing green information/audits systems to gain useful information on organizational efficiency and corporate environmental standards (Marcus & Fremeth, 2009 & Shoeb, 2015).

iv Green pay & rewards

Environmental incentives can involve the practice of lifestyle benefits, ranging from carbon offsets to free bicycles, engaging people in the environmental scheme, while acknowledging their efforts and achievements (Pillai & Sivathanu, 2014). The total reward system is defined as pay and salary, bonuses and incentives as well as employees benefits to safeguard their welfares, In another definition, it is stated as combinations of salary, benefits, recognition and other variable pay, which are crucial to give a total reward package (Ednah, Geoffrey, 2017 & Milne, 2007). By integrating the basics of green management in the reward program, managers can encourage green behaviors.

v. Green employee relation

When conscientious workers are empowered to take action and have the discretion to decide on green initiatives, they are more satisfied, motivated, retained, and supported in achieving high environmental performance (Miliman, 2013). In other research, supervisor support is similarly established as a significant factor influencing engagement and retention of employees (Ahsana et al., 2013).

2.2 Theoretical implications

There is limited research using GHRM practices as a means of a solution to retain employees in a hotel. So, this study fills the limited gaps, Thus, it contributes to the current knowledge base in the study of human resource management. It is expected by the present research to extend the academic study of green practices (GP) in the aspects of hotels which is relatively scanty, thereby enhancing the theoretical body. And future scholars wishing to research a similar analysis, this research knowledge will be very helpful.

2.3 Practical Implications

Implementation of this initiative is known to deliver a wide-ranging advantage including income and cost reduction in hotels (Ayuso, 2006; Kasim & Scarlat, 2007) and attainment of improved reputation (Ayuso, 2006; Nicholls & Kang, 2012). The research also emphasis giving vibrant information to the organization in the best way to adopt sustainable practices in hotels. Also, the study will stimulate Non-green hotels' management to adopt a green initiative. Furthermore, the effect of pride on workers in the hotel industry has been discovered and demonstrated beautifully, motivating them to do their best with little or no supervision. An organization's employees should find the study useful on the reasons why the hotel should
embrace and follow green practices. This also stimulates the employee commitment to their job and promotes a healthier organization environment if the initiatives are introduced and properly managed as explained in this study. The research also focuses on providing the company with vital information on the best way to implement sustainable practices of hotels. An organization's employees should find the study useful on the reasons why the hotel should embrace and follow GHRM practices. The application of this initiative is known to provide a widespread benefit that involved cost reduction and profit in hotels (Ayuso, 2006, Bohdahnowicz, 2005 & Kasim, 2007) and achievement of improved reputation (Ayuso, 2006; Nicholls & Kang, 2012; Park, 2009). Also, the study will stimulate Non-green hotels' management to adopt a green initiative.

2.4 Conclusion

Green human resource management strategies have become so critical for fostering employee engagement, environmental productivity, and competitive advantage. Adopting the benefits of these methods, such as human resources in hotels, the atmosphere, and workers' consciousness, which in turn motivates their green actions and their capacity to carry out environmental initiatives within their organization. Proper application of the GRHM procedures tends to improve employee retention.
REFERENCES


